

**SPRINGETTSBURY TOWNSHIP
BUDGET WORK SESSION**

**OCTOBER 26, 2021
APPROVED**

The Springettsbury Township Board of Supervisors held a Budget Work Session on Tuesday, October 26, 2021 at 6:00 p.m. at the offices of York Area Fire and Rescue located at 50 Commons Drive, York, PA in person and by Zoom technology.

MEMBERS IN

ATTENDANCE: Mark Swomley, Chairman
George Dvoryak, Vice Chairman
Don Bishop
Bob Cox
George Dvoryak
Charles Wurster

ALSO IN

ATTENDANCE: Mark Hodgkinson, Township Manager
Terry Hummel, Director of Finance
Dori Bowders, Director of Administrative Operations
Nitza Sanchez-Bowser, Director of HR
Daniel Hoff, YAUFRR Chief
Austin Hunt, Chairman YAUFRR Commission
Lisa Einsig, YAUFRR Administrative Director
Kris Shearer, YAUFRR
Adam Potter, YAUFRR
Chuck Yingling, YAUFRR
Matt Russ, YAUFRR
Brett Graham, YAUFRR (via Zoom)
Clyde Beaver, YAUFRR (via Zoom)
Dave Detwiler, Spring Garden Township
Daniel Rooney, Spring Garden Township
Matt Arnold, YAUFRR
Alyson Arnold, Springettsbury Township Resident
Lester Rhoads, GYPFFA
Ed Morin, GYPFFA
Abby Gibb, Communications Manager
Sue Sipe, Stenographer

1. CALL TO ORDER

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. PROPOSED BUDGET REVIEW

A. York Area United Fire and Rescue

- I. Comments from Springettsbury Township Delegates to the York Area United Fire and Rescue Board of Commissioners
 - a. Comments from Commissioner George Dvoryak

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak stated that there is one item to make a decision on relative to the budget, which is the addition of the three firefighters in the budget for next year. He noted this was identified as Step 1 of a 10-year plan to add three firefighters every other year totaling 18 firefighters overall by 2032. He stated he received feedback from one person in the community who had concerns about the administrative increases requested in the budget for support staff based on the belief that a more thorough vetting in that regard was needed.

Mr. Dvoryak stated his recommendation to the Board to be discussed later is to ask the YAUFRR staff to remove the three positions that are currently in the budget, as well as the administrative pay increases until better vetting is conducted to justify the need for those additional positions. He noted although he was not opposed to increasing the YAUFRR staffing. He personally needs to be convinced that a proper and thorough vetting for increase of staffing in the magnitude of what is proposed over the 10-year period is necessary.

Mr. Dvoryak indicated he prepared new material from the discussion at the last meeting. He wanted to address several concerns after comments were made. He noted although a decision would not be accomplished at this meeting, he felt it should remain a high priority for YAUFRR to come up with a better governance structure to make decisions on big-ticket items beyond the current structure which is a full-time Fire Chief reporting to a part-time volunteer board who struggle to get individuals to volunteer for the Board and show up for meetings and take a thorough interest in the discussion and the issues.

Mr. Dvoryak discussed the 10-year plan cost for the 18 firefighters. He noted Chief Hoff provided an estimated salary. Mr. Dvoryak was not sure if salaries were the only cost, since there would be tax impact, benefits, and additional equipment. He noted there was also a 2% annual increase each year, but looking at the contract structure there is a laddering effect and he was not sure if 2% was adequate to cover what the annual increase would be with the laddering effect.

Mr. Dvoryak indicated his concern was also the comparisons made to York City, Lancaster and Harrisburg. He noted those are cities which have run for decades with a tax and spend mentality for firefighter costs, including pensions that are exorbitant and real estate taxes that are charged in those locations, which he felt were out of control and among the highest around the state. Mr. Dvoryak referred to a conversation he had with the consultant who worked on the YAUFRR merger, at which time Mr. Dvoryak asked him a question and the consultant indicated there would not be any cost savings operationally for YAUFRR because the union contracts prevented it, as well as operational changes. Mr. Dvoryak stated he determined from that conversation that managerially Springettsbury fire stations would continue to be run the same way post YAUFRR as they were pre YAUFRR. He felt that statement was relative to the comparisons made to these large cities and felt it was more relevant to look at municipalities that are more like Springettsbury, Spring Garden and Manchester Township and make those comparisons in terms of demographics, geography and mix of retail and commercial, residential before making decisions on staffing.

Mr. Dvoryak indicated the third discussion held related to the standards created and aspired to be achieved through this process. He noted from his involvement with standards historically, they can be flawed and vary greatly depending which standard is used. He noted the State of Pennsylvania sets a minimum staffing standard for all fire services such as YAUFRR. It was his understanding that YAUFRR meets those standards. Mr. Dvoryak mentioned from the survey with York City provided by Chief Hoff, his understanding is at present YAUFRR has an average daily staffing of 14 firefighters, York City has an average daily staffing of 11 firefighters, Hanover has 8 and Manheim Township has 12.

Mr. Dvoryak brought up the concept of mutual aid. He noted at the previous meeting he had mentioned mutual aid and whether there is anything they could do with mutual aid to help with staffing levels. He referred to a report that was circulated to the YAUFRR Board at each meeting which presented YAUFRR mutual aid statistics broken down by municipality and by township. The report showed in each township the number of times mutual aid was provided during the month. Mr. Dvoryak indicated from that report he noticed several municipalities where the ratios each month seemed skewed. He provided an example noting that he was not sure from the reports what the level of expenditures or resources were used. He felt there were many questions that a governance structure beyond what the volunteer board have time to vet, should be investigated.

WURSTER

Mr. Wurster recognized guests in attendance: Chief Hoff, YAUFRR
YAUFRR Commissioners: Austin Hunt, Chairman, Dan Rooney, Spring Garden Township

Mr. Wurster stated his remarks are as a public policy decision. The question, he noted, is shall we as a township as part of YAUFRR and as a Commissioner on the YAUFRR Board, commit to the long-term strategy of hiring three new firefighters every two years for 10 years. Mr. Wurster indicated one of his questions is – what is that long term cost? He noted they were provided with a 2021 budget which illustrates some of the cost forecast for hiring the first three of the new firefighters in 2022. He concluded the cost to hire those three new firefighters in 2022 is \$367,000 annually. When layered with a 2% inflation factor that amount grows over the period of 10 years up to \$447,000. When layered over the addition of three new firefighters for every year thereafter, and continuing to inflate that, the cost of embarking on this hiring strategy comes out to \$15 million over the course of the 10-year period. That almost doubles the current budget of \$8.5 million. That is an additional increase of approximately \$1.5 million per year which is weighted at the back end. This is a strategy that has some weighty financial considerations, specifically when looking at other elements of the proposal.

Mr. Wurster addressed the justification for this strategy, asking if they heard an overwhelming command from the business community, community at large or any demand for an increase because of some weaknesses in the fire service. He noted it was understood that the plan is to meet a national standard. Having participated in several sessions of the Strategic Planning Committee, he noted he understood the value and the importance of aspiring to reach these national fire protection standards. In pursuing the funding for this effort, Mr. Wurster indicated it does come with an increase in excess of 4% for each municipality to contribute toward the operating costs of the plan just for the

first year. Mr. Wurster stated in reviewing this from a public policy perspective, he questioned if they have explored other alternatives in terms of phasing of the hiring - have they considered funding other than taxpayers. Is there a way to obtain certain grants or other funding that will allow some level of increase of the hiring to meet the standard? In viewing the national standard, is it possible to have a concept and understand how many other fire companies throughout the United States meet the NFPA standard.

BISHOP Mr. Bishop commended Mr. Dvoryak and Mr. Wurster for their effective presentations and indicated he aligns himself with their comments.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley commented that he looks at budgets with a macro view and as Mr. Wurster outlined, the magnitude of increase over the next 10 years does not make sense. He agreed with comments from both Supervisors that they need to better understand what the strategy is for staffing at appropriate levels. Mr. Swomley looked at the possible areas of growth in the communities and did not see potential growth. He also looked at the tax base trying to return value to constituents without raising taxes. He did not see how that could be maintained with an increase of this magnitude. He determined along with the other supervisors; they need to know more about why 18 additional firefighters are needed over the next 10 years.

II. YAUFRR Discussion

a. 2022 Budget

HOFF Chief Hoff asked to address several points which were discussed, first being the question about his use of a 2% estimate. He noted for the first three years 2022, 2023 and 2024, he could provide actual payroll increases since they are under the contract. In any year beyond 2024 he went with an estimate because he does not know what that will be without negotiation.

Chief Hoff referred to Mr. Dvoryak's comment about the comparisons which he provided, several of them being third-class cities, but one similar municipality is Manheim Township which Chief Hoff provided. He noted Manheim Township is able to provide an increased staffing over what YAUFRR can currently provide. He agreed with the sentiment that they should focus on what is best for the community YAUFRR serves. Chief Hoff referred to the comment from one citizen with concern over administrative costs proposed. He noted one citizen complaint out of 58,000 people served is encouraging. Chief Hoff stated the fact is the proposals they have made for the administrative staff make sense and are needed.

Chief Hoff clarified that Pennsylvania does not have a staffing standard for fire departments. He noted an SR60 study was done approximately 10 years ago. SR6 was a study done most recently, however those are recommendations which far exceed staffing levels, and SR6 was geared towards survival of the failing volunteer system. He noted Pennsylvania does not require certification of their firefighters.

Chief Hoff referred to Mr. Wurster's comments regarding grants. Chief Hoff stated although they do pursue grants, those decisions have to be made and supported by all

three municipalities before they can apply for them because of the multi-year commitment required by their Charter Agreement.

Chief Hoff stated in regards to technological advances which are many in the fire service, one thing remains true in order to put out fires and rescue people, firefighters have to get into buildings, as well as on the hose line and put water on the fire to save lives. He stated no technology would take away the manpower issue.

Chief Hoff stated he was aware Mr. Hodgkinson disseminated all the information to the Board which Chief Hoff provided to him throughout the process. He also wanted to assure of all information provided, it is understood he would never intentionally provide information that he did not believe to be true. Chief Hoff indicated he received some feedback after his budget presentation in September and there was some question about the validity of the information regarding NFPA and ISO. He noted the National Fire Protection Association is the only standards creating organization relative to the fire department. Chief Hoff asserted his proposal is not to meet the national standard. The national standard for a professional career department is 4 people per apparatus. He stressed the cost that this Township does not have to bear on its own. It is a split and the cost for 2022 the other 63% of YAUFRR – Manchester and Spring Garden are prepared to assume.

Chief Hoff indicated the 2022 budget was held to a 0 dollar increase for non-personnel operating costs. The Battalion Chief and Administrator Director adjustments made are very much necessary for the future of the department. Chief Hoff stated he made the recommendation to accrue over 12 years since he wanted to stagger it, being conscious of the financial impact to the Townships. He noted that recommendation was made based on current situations.

Chief Hoff referred to comments made regarding mutual aid. He noted their mutual aid situation is under control. The reports they were seeing 2-3 years ago included volunteer fire police responses which does not come out of the YAUFRR budget and does not affect their operations. He further noted their mutual aid is in a situation consistently where they import assistance from their mutual aid partners far more than they get help from us. In discussing are there other options with this, leaning more heavily on a volunteer mutual aid company to subsidize what is our responsibility to provide is not feasible. He noted they are short on qualified staffing as well.

Chief Hoff stated his job is to field the most professional and capable fire department possible. Being professional implies exceeding minimal requirements in a timely and correct fashion. Capability means performing essential job performance requirements to the best of their ability. Regarding NFPA standards, that is not only meeting staffing numbers but meeting the 90th percentile benchmarks related to turnout travel and overall response times - times to achieve adequate water supply and first water on the fire. ISO is also not only focused on staffing numbers, its based on time and distance, as well as timely response. He noted ISO does impact insurance rates of residents.

Chief Hoff referred to the mention of the 2007 ordinance passed which led to the creation of YAUFRR. He noted it was based on the Joint Fire Services study which Mr. Les

Adams performed. The study specifically referenced the lack of staffing on their fire apparatus and stated at the very minimum this mode of staffing likely delays any fire attack operations or rescue efforts until additional units arrive on the scene, potentially resulting in further personal injury or damage due to the delay. The study went on to state the staffing level of engines and trucks is insufficient for an engine or truck to initiate independent fire operations tactics. At this staffing level, units must take up a defensive mode of operations until further units and staff arrive. Moreover, rescue operations with one or two staff members are either significantly degraded or not possible and presents serious safety issues for service providers and stakeholders. Chief Hoff pointed out the study made two recommendations – one which indicated they should not be sending firefighters out by themselves on a fire truck which has been done by Springgettsbury Township since 1995. The second recommendation was for the future to establish minimal staffing of three firefighters per apparatus. Chief Hoff pointed out this was created 15 years ago. Chief Hoff alluded to the statement he made to the newspaper some time after that, indicating they could not put out a house fire with five people. He stated this is still a fact. He stressed this is not an attempt to grow for the sake of expanding the department. It has one goal which is safety for their personnel and safety for the people they serve. He also pointed out he provided the National Institute of Standards and Technology study on fire ground staffing which showed clearly that two person crews cannot complete essential fire ground tasks in time to rescue occupants without subjecting either firefighters or occupants to an increasing hazardous atmosphere. Chief Hoff also pointed out an incident occurred last week when their firefighters pulled a gentleman out of his home which was on fire. He noted it took three units to get there to have sufficient people to put water on the fire and pull a man out. Unfortunately, the person perished.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley asked if having three extra firefighters next year would change that situation.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated it very well could – every call is different. In this case where they place people is on the ladder truck that would have been first due on that box and that could have made a great difference.

Chief Hoff referred to the most recent edition of the PA Township News noting they showed second class townships have the greatest percentage of growth over the last 30 years. Community growth correlates to an increase in service demand.

Chief Hoff pointed out in 2012 the concept of a fund balance became part of the YAUFRR budgetary process. Because it was a start-up in the first year Springgettsbury's increasing contribution to YAUFRR was \$82,939, while the fund balance return was only 25.3%. In the six years that followed where the fund balance return was part of the annual process, Springgettsbury's return was consistently in excess of their annual appropriation increase. In 2018 the addition of Manchester Township occurred and Springgettsbury received over \$600,000 in fund balance return from YAUFRR when the Commission reset it to zero. The following year the fund balance was half of the contribution increase because they were starting at zero. Since that time, Springgettsbury is back to receiving a credit which is not budgeted. He noted the excess credit Springgettsbury is getting back is a function of the audit process.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley asked for clarification on the credit.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated in 2018 the credit was \$600,000 spread over each installation. He clarified that was greater than what the increase was from the previous year. Chief Hoff stated since their inception, looking back at previous budgets, Springettsbury has benefited from more than \$2 million being credited back. Chief Hoff reiterated they do not budget for a fund balance return but is a matter of conscientious administration and maintaining the philosophy of the management of needs vs. wants. Chief Hoff pointed out that the 2022 budget, although they cannot control the unfunded liability, it must be considered in the total contribution. In this year when looking at the total contribution, Springettsbury is paying less for 2022 than in 2021.

Chief Hoff indicated part of the reason he took this staffing approach is when they went into arbitration this year with Local 2377, one of the big-ticket items in their arbitration argument was staffing, they were asking for an immediate 12 additional hires. He noted they opposed this mandate because they understood what that would do not only to Township budgets but also logistically make it difficult to manage from a daily operations perspective. While they did not disagree with the need for apparatus staffing, they were opposed to the Union proposal. Chief Hoff stated that is why a slow staggering increase is preferred, since it makes more sense and avoids a sudden spike in costs and permits adequate training and onboarding, as well coincides with their bi-annual eligibility list creation to allow obtaining the best talent available.

Chief Hoff encouraged everyone to visit the fire school to observe the work the firefighters do and why it is so manpower intensive.

Chief Hoff stated the requested budgetary increase is 3.7% from 2021 to 2022 which when considering the cost of living is likely to exceed 6%. They are still committed to holding their non-personnel related costs at zero. The staffing increases are appropriate at this time because with the exception of one injury they have not experienced a more significant injury or a loss of life or high dollar high impact loss attributable to the inability to accomplish their necessary tasks.

Chief Hoff asked the Board for consideration of his request for the additional staffing, noting this is more than just a financial issue, since lives are the consideration. He indicated the citizens deserve to be told why they do not deserve an adequate fire department staff level. He noted Spring Garden Township has already approved the 2022 YAUFRR budget. Manchester Township will include it as their final budget draft in two weeks. He noted he has heard support from them. Chief Hoff referred to monetary sources Springettsbury recently received, in addition to the history of YAUFRR returning more than they asked the Township for in increase each year. He noted they provided recommendations from the Fire Chief supported by national standards and ISO rating schedule which directly impacts the insurance rate. He indicated they have the Joint Fire Services plan produced by a fire service consultant and expert. He noted all messages have been the same, staffing levels is sub-par and needs to be addressed. The first step is three additional firefighters in 2022. He noted he is not asking for approval of the entire

plan since the budgeting process occurs each year. He indicated any of the three Townships can stop the process in any given year.

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak referred to staffing in Pennsylvania, he recalled at a YAUFRR meeting he heard Solicitor Hovis say if you provide a paid fire service in Pennsylvania, the State holds to some minimum staffing standards.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated that was not correct, noting NFPA has two different standards – one is for a volunteer fire department or a combination department that is largely volunteer. The one he is referencing is a career department. He reiterated there is no staffing standard in Pennsylvania.

BISHOP Mr. Bishop referred to the September YAUFRR meeting, noting another staffing issue Chief Hoff brought up had to do with Battalion Chiefs, that there was a need to hire additional Battalion Chiefs because of attrition, and there were not enough qualified applicants to fill the position. The proposed solution was to increase the salary for the Battalion Chiefs to obtain the right applicants.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated there was not a shortage of Battalion Chiefs. For the present situation, their complement of full-time Battalion Chiefs is adequate. He noted what he was saying is when they needed to replace their last Battalion Chief, he only had two applicants from within the department. What was cited as the reason for lack of interest was the lack of benefit financially to go from being a Senior Captain to a Battalion Chief. There was not enough separation between the two salaries to make the position attractive. Chief Hoff indicated he pointed that out in preparation for the 2021 budget in which they made the recommendation to make the adjustment over the course of two years to control increases. This would be the second year of correcting the salary situation so that moving forward their Battalion Chiefs would be approximately 4.9% over the base salary of a similarly tenured Captain.

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak referred to the proposed administrative position increases, asking Chief Hoff if he used a study or a survey to determine educational requirements for the position, the same level of certifications that may be required for the job, same level of job duties and responsibilities and did he agree they were important considerations to consider before making a determination if a position was adequately paid.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated in this case he did not focus so much on education as he did job functions. He noted when he did that survey, he specifically looked at positions that were dual-role, human resources, and finance. When he appealed to people in his network, he was trying to match job expectations and responsibilities.

BISHOP Mr. Bishop asked how did he measure how well a person does that job.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated he has someone who is on top of all job functions on a daily basis and communicates with the Commission on financial matters exceedingly well, as well as manages the Administrative Assistant and does everything and more of what the job description entails.

COX Mr. Cox referred to an incident in which his house caught fire. He noted firefighters were there in under two minutes and saved his house. He expressed his appreciation for the firefighters.

b. YAUFRR Governance Structure

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak stated although this subject has been discussed numerous times, it calls for a different governance structure in terms of making decisions, commitments to a strategy and the costs associated to assure a governance structure is in place, which has time and resources added to make sure they are doing the right things for all stakeholders. He reiterated his concerns about the current structure with YAUFRR which consists of a volunteer board, which mostly changes from year to year. Mr. Dvoryak stated from his personal experience on the Board it takes at least a year sitting in on the meetings to get a sense of what is happening and assimilation. He noted other family and job responsibilities limit time to do the vetting to make important decisions. There also may be individuals on the Board who may be fulfilling an obligation but are not fully vested in the functions of the Board. Mr. Dvoryak felt it was critical to the employees of YAUFRR to have a governance in place which evaluates the entire organization and what can be done differently to create more efficiency and safer. Mr. Dvoryak stated at one of the YAUFRR meetings, options were offered which included possibly hiring a consultant to assess the situation, possible hiring of a full-time business manager, engaging the Township Managers of the three municipalities in the process. He noted at this time YAUFRR has had no continuing conversation in that regard. He recommended continuing to have dialogue to determine an effective governance structure for YAUFRR to do the best job for all.

HUNT Mr. Hunt stated he supported Mr. Dvoryak and as part of their YAUFRR commission work, have discussed some of those ideas. He noted they will keep this as an item live on the YAUFRR agenda for ongoing discussion.

WURSTER Mr. Wurster opened it up to fellow Supervisors to offer ideas and suggestions of how to explore a better governance model in considering financial decisions and understand their implications before acting.

HUNT Mr. Hunt stated as a businessman with an engineering mind, he approaches it also with what is the right answer, starting with the two extremes – never increase the price, or a fire station on every corner. Bringing it back towards the center, he noted you must trust someone, whether that is a business manager or a consultant or a government body in NFPA. He strongly admitted that NFPA staffing for any fire department is untenable. It's distended because the NFPA job descriptions typically have one or two job descriptions that are filled by a single person. He noted as a part-time volunteer YAUFRR board member, there is a lot of information and it does take a while to get up to speed. His tenure through several Fire Chiefs, both municipal and for YAUFRR involved asking the questions.

Mr. Hunt reminded the Board if they do not approve the 2022 budget request, it would probably come back next year. Approving it does not mean they are automatically on board for the next 10 years. He acknowledged Mr. Wurster's mathematical extrapolation

which identified the cost. However, he noted the size of the compounded number does not directly correlate to the immediate need. Mr. Hunt agreed with Chief Hoff that YAUFRR is understaffed, noting he has seen several experts come to the same conclusion. He indicated before combining with Spring Garden and Springettsbury the geographic boundaries meant that Spring Garden was overstaffed with 15 firefighters for 24/7 coverage, since the tax base of Spring Garden was too small. Pre-merger Springettsbury had 18 firefighters and was accumulating \$300-400,000 of overtime to fill the gaps. With the merger, the slight over-staffing in Spring Garden and the slight understaffing in Springettsbury, the overtime decreased to zero.

Mr. Hunt stated he trusted Chief Hoff and his conclusion in regard to the need for increased staffing. He reiterated an approval of the 2022 budget would mean a one-year budget and not automatically endorsing the 10-year budget. He felt it was a good idea for any chief executive to present a long-term vision to invite comments.

Mr. Hunt indicated in terms of governance, he agreed to be on a Board which requires an investment at Township or YAUFRR level to understand the workings. He noted when they envisioned YAUFRR they knew the Fire Chief needed to become more of a manager than a department head. That structural level of the township manager between the department heads – the Fire Chief and police chief, and the Board that buffers is very helpful to the Board since it is a gatekeeper. He discussed with Chief Hoff the concept of developing more dialogue with the three Township Managers, as peers. Mr. Hunt stated he believed the full-time person proposed is Chief Hoff.

Mr. Hunt stated he was concerned with the concept of bringing in a consultant or a business manager for individual projects, since it would be uncertain as to when they would be needed and if they were informed on the project. Mr. Hunt recommended both the Chief and the Township Managers have a more peer-to-peer dialogue.

Mr. Hunt stated he agreed with the comments made about lack of volunteers to serve on township boards. He noted the current Charter Agreement indicates that board members at YAUFRR need to be an elected official from the participating municipalities. He recommended the charter be amended to allow Townships to appoint a resident citizen as a board member. This would allow soliciting someone who has an interest and commitment who would not be confined to the election cycle.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley commented he reviewed the zoning opportunities map which he determined revealed the Township is relatively built out and it did not look like it was growing as rapidly as the numbers presented by Mr. Wurster. He questioned if they are proposing a growth that is too fast for what we have.

HUNT Mr. Hunt stated if you graph it you must pick a point as to when it was correct. For math purposes, he noted YAUFRR has not had any significant staffing increases since 2010 but there has been a 16% increase in the census population in this region.

Mr. Hunt indicated when the charter was developed, he reviewed the permutations on taxable asset base to try to define allocations, population, and road miles. What he

determined is there is no correlation between a fire department budget and any tangible statistical number, since there is no real market value assessment.

Mr. Hunt discussed the response time for a house fire, and the rate at which a house fire increases which can double in size every two minutes. He noted if it takes 8-10 minutes from dispatch to arrival the fire is 16 times greater. Mr. Hunt indicated he did comparisons between firefighting and other municipal services, i.e., public works, police, and sewer. He noted ultimately firefighters need to be staffed for the maximum need when there is a structure fire.

Mr. Hunt stated the second biggest cost factor in firefighting is it is asset based. 85% of the budget is labor and benefits, but they have huge amounts of capital which are expensive to replace. He noted regionalization has allowed to reduce the redundancy in capital assets. He indicated he supports Chief Hoff's recommendation for one-year growth of three firefighters and is not recommending to automatically plan out for 10 years.

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak clarified when he spoke at the beginning of the meeting, what he was recommending is removing the three positions that are in the budget from the budget until such time as the proper vetting was done. He indicated he was not opposed to adding additional staff, just wanted to make sure the proper vetting was done. From his perspective, he indicated they could put those positions back in January/February whenever the proper vetting is done. He questioned what the harm would be to, instead of looking at York City, Lancaster and Harrisburg but to surveying municipalities similar to Springettsbury to see how that compares to YAUFRR.

HUNT Mr. Hunt indicated none except legislatively it has to be included in the budget.

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak stated they can make a decision next year to amend the budget.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley noted the budget can be amended on January 6 but it has to be in by January 13 and there is a process for that to be done.

HUNT Mr. Hunt questioned what answers he would need in the next two months to feel more comfortable.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley stated he was not proposing to wait until January and would have to make their decision soon.

HUNT Mr. Hunt stated his point was this might be a good opportunity to test the new governance structure, by having Mr. Hodgkinson and Chief Hoff meet to discuss it.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley a new governance structure would have to be a formal process.

HUNT Mr. Hunt indicated he is backing away from any kind of change to the governance structure because it is created by the Charter Agreement, which needs to be amended and approved by the three townships. He stated the current township structure works with a Board of Supervisors, manager and department heads. He noted they have taken the Fire

Chief department head from under the manager and made him a semi-manager of his own entity. Mr. Hunt questioned how to create a full-time employee/liaison between the board and Fire Chief. He indicated that is where the Township Managers have enough tenure and education to understand the questions and have dialogue to get answers.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley stated, as elected officials, their only control when they remove one of the heads of the department and put them in charge of a group that reports to three different entities, is through the budget.

HUNT Mr. Hunt concurred. He stated the Charter Agreement provides that if 75% of the charter municipalities do not approve the budget (1 of the 3) the previous year's budget stays in place.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley noted if they were having the discussion with Chief Hoff as opposed to Chief King and the other department heads, they would be having the internal discussion why three hires instead of one or two for the next budget, whereas they are in a different discussion because of the other two municipalities. Mr. Swomley alluded to Chief Hoff's statement that because the other two municipalities approved it, Springettsbury should too.

HUNT Mr. Hunt clarified Chief Hoff's statement noting he presented the budget to the other townships which were not yet heard by Springettsbury. Mr. Hunt noted that is why he took the opportunity to solicit questions.

BISHOP Mr. Bishop asked what Chief Hoff had presented to the other municipalities that YAUFRR representatives did not hear.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated no one heard anything different from him. After he presented the draft budget to YAUFRR Commission in August, he met with each of the Township Managers and reviewed what he proposed to the YAUFRR Commission. No one received any other information – all were provided the same information. He emphasized he was not trying to say that because the other two townships have acted or are poised to act, that Springettsbury should act as well. He was simply pointing out he made the same case to them which he made to Springettsbury.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley commented one of the things he heard Chief Hoff say was that Springettsbury is making \$450,000 in transfer funds so why shouldn't they give us our budget money. He noted that was his perception of what Chief Hoff was saying. Chairman Swomley stated Springettsbury has worked hard to maintain a high level of service with a very low tax burden on their constituents.

HOFF Chief Hoff offered apologies for that impression, stating that was not his intent. His intent was to say from a financial standpoint through the course of history with YAUFRR, they have returned a tremendous amount of money to Springettsbury Township and the other townships as well in the form of fund balance or excess cash.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley commented in talking about numbers, he said he understood Chief Hoff's point that numbers do not make up for the loss of life, but that also does not make

up for spending considerable money more than is necessary. Chairman Swomley explained the concept of the returned funds with the interpretation that if budget funds are not spent it would return to the general fund.

HOFF Chief Hoff stated his point in talking about the monies was not to say there is excess money which should be given to YAUFRR. He stated his point was not putting a price tag on the safety of YAUFRR firefighters and the community.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley stated it is a decision about money, and the discussion is how much is necessary to prevent the loss of life.

HUNT Mr. Hunt expanded that thought to say a budget is to fund a one-year tactical vision. He commented about Springettsbury tax base, noting a large amount of revenue comes from mercantile tax which may or may not be exclusively from residents. Mr. Hunt noted a large portion of calls are motor vehicle accidents, with a large percentage from the I-83 corridor which probably are not residents. Consequently, YAUFRR has implemented a revenue stream where they bill for motor vehicle assistance activities which is reducing the tax burden on the residents. He noted that was the number Chief Hoff alluded to which was oversold originally. Mr. Hunt believed that was a great way to maintain the services for the residents and is an alternate revenue stream which is not directly on the backs of their residents. He credited Springettsbury for providing that idea.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley pointed out the vote is not tonight since this was a budget work session.

HUNT Mr. Hunt noted the decision does not need to be ratified until the end of the fiscal year. His point is was not to wait until December to arrive at a decision.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley stated his expectation is to have the final decision included in their budget schedule.

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak provided a historic perspective to address the notion of approval of the YAUFRR budget. During the inception of YAUFRR when Spring Garden and Springettsbury merged, the original Charter Agreement called for a formula. At that time, Springettsbury paid 55% of the new budget costs for YAUFRR and Spring Garden paid 45%. He believed that was based on the budgets at that time or how much each institution was spending on fire services. That agreement also had provisions in ensuing years where the number could change based on call activity. This ended up creating much controversy, even though most of the cost of fire services is fixed. Springettsbury's share was growing in excess of 60%, while Spring Garden's contribution was decreasing. This was a source of controversy and there was a measure put in place to cap it. When Manchester joined there was an acknowledgement for using a formula which varies cost, since underlying fixed cost did not make sense. He indicated today from the perspective of each municipality, the question is could this same level of fire service be provided if not in YAUFRR for less money. Mr. Dvoryak stated this would be the test of fairness to Springettsbury Township based on if they were not part of YAUFRR how much the cost would be to provide the same service.

HUNT Mr. Hunt concurred with Mr. Dvoryak stating at the original inception the concept was to maintain the current budgets at that time. There was a formula which started to adjust that slowly based on call volume. He noted when they started to extrapolate the call volume would have extended it further and Spring Garden would pay less. The Charter Agreement was then amended to have a negotiated cap at 64% which is where it was and then that same logic of bringing in the current budgets, they approached Manchester and brought their current budget in so at that point the dollar amount of Springettsbury and Spring Garden stayed the same with the new portion of the Manchester dollar coming in and that became the new fractional portion. Mr. Hunt stated now it is negotiated. He indicated if a municipality thinks their percentage is too high or low it is open to negotiations. The call volume aspect has been taken out.

B. Springettsbury Township 2022 Proposed Budget

HODGKINSON Mr. Hodgkinson stated this is proposed for any follow-up from the previous budget meeting.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

ARNOLD Mrs. Alison Arnold stated she is a resident of Springettsbury Township for 25 years. She lives on Folkstone Court. Mrs. Arnold indicated she has a healthcare background, having a bachelor's degree in Healthcare Administration, having experience with budgeting. From a personal point of view, she asked the Board to imagine if it was their family member involved in a house fire and could not get out, how would they feel if when YAUFRR showed up and because they did not have enough firefighters, they could not rescue that family member until another engine showed up. Mrs. Arnold pointed out there would be no amount of money put on a family member's life. Mrs. Arnold also commented in regard to the governance discussion, she found it offensive the comment was made that the people who are left holding the straw do not want to be on the YAUFRR Board. She alluded to the fact that her husband is a YAUFRR firefighter and it was eye opening for her to understand what all they do. She noted the firefighters are involved in more than house fires and are often times the first ones responding to and treating medical calls. She asked the Board to look at the situation with an empathic mind and not put a price on people.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley noted he appreciated Ms. Arnold's comments, but thought she needed to understand when they go through their formation meeting every January, they are on all kinds of committees and they work among themselves to figure out who gets assigned. He indicated Mr. Wurster and Mr. Dvoryak volunteered to serve on the YAUFRR Commission and have done so with distinction. Chairman Swomley apologized if Ms. Arnold interpreted something other than to mean that the fire department was any less important than anything else the Board does, with fire, health and police being the top three.

DVORYAK Mr. Dvoryak added there are dedicated hardworking committed volunteers on the YAUFRR Commission.

DETWILER Mr. Dave Detwiler stated he is a Commissioner of Spring Garden Township. He indicated the Springettsbury Township's contribution this year is \$3,284,660. The

contribution for the Springettsbury population is \$27,058, which he noted averages to \$117 per person, per year. Per day it is 33 cents per resident. He asked how low do they want to take that. He noted Spring Garden is 49 cents per day.

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley stated they are talking about how much to increase it, not how much to take it down.

ROONEY Mr. Dan Rooney, Spring Garden Township Commissioner and YAUFRR Commission member. Mr. Rooney stated Spring Garden Township is very cognizant of budget issues. He noted 87% of their tax base is residential so the impact is more on a residential tax base vs. mercantile. He noted the Spring Garden Township Board made a conscious decision to support the increase, based on their relationship with Chief Hoff who they respect and trust his knowledge and experience in operations, and view him as their fire expert. He indicated they are confident in Chief Hoff's recommendations. Mr. Rooney indicated while they do not want to raise taxes in Spring Garden, however he determined there is a value-added component to contemplate in determining funds needed. Mr. Rooney alluded to the previous fire study completed which indicated additional staff is needed. He agreed they could review other options to determine the long-term commitment. He asked for Springettsbury Township's support for this year and then next year form a committee to look at the long term plan. He offered to serve on that committee in his capacity as having experience as a comprehensive long-term planner.

4. ADJOURNMENT

SWOMLEY Chairman Swomley adjourned the meeting at 7:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Doreen K. Bowders
Secretary

/ses